

Human Trafficking From A Multidisciplinary Perspectives: A Literature Review

Ravi Mahalingam ^{1*}

¹ Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences, University of Malaya, Malaysia

Corresponding author, ravimahalingam84@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

The crime of human trafficking is a complex phenomenon that is often affected by a wide range of social, economic, political, and cultural aspects. To fully understand the crime of human trafficking, one must analyze the crime from multiple domains or perspectives. However, the human trafficking literature generally focused on aspects such as causal factors, victimization, and policy response, while other aspects like migration, the market system or the perpetrators that involved in the crime are given little attention. Therefore, this paper is an attempt to review the existing literature on human trafficking which includes a discussion on the connection between human trafficking and migration, human trafficking as a business enterprise, human trafficking and organized crime, as well as human trafficking from other contexts such as human rights, feminism, and security. The literature review comprised extensive information collected from 134 books, articles, academic papers, and policy documents with most of them are from the year 2010 and above. The review found a great deal of work on human trafficking that focused on deliberating the crime as an effect of irregular migration of people from the source countries to the destination countries. Besides, the review also indicate that the crime of human trafficking is nurtured by three important factors, namely the supply of potential victims for exploitation in the source countries, the constant demand for trafficked victims in the destination countries, and the presence of organized crime groups who act as intermediaries in supplying the victims to the end-users. Overall, it shows that the crime of human trafficking is business-oriented and profit-driven activity.

Keywords: human trafficking, migration, business enterprise, organized crime.

INTRODUCTION

The genesis of human trafficking can be attributed to the beginning of civilization and the primeval practice of slavery. The practice of slavery was recorded as early as 539 BC and institutionally legalized in many societies until the late 1900s but is now considered as an illegal activity or a crime in all countries around the world (Smith & Kangaspunta, 2012). From the ancient Greek and Roman to the present times, human has been exposed to various forms of exploitation, be it physical or sexual. Even though slavery had existed since 539 BC and was a common form of oppression in many parts of the ancient world, however, the 1400s marked the proliferation of the phenomenon with the beginning of European slave trade, also known as the Atlantic slave trade, in Africa (Evans & Rydén, 2008). Portugal was the first European country that traded thousands of Africans to the Americas as well as other European countries. Soon after, many other

European countries like the British, Spanish, Holland, France, and Sweden follow suit by engaging in the slave trade in Africa as well as in other countries (Abramova, 1979). Patrick Manning, a historian, estimated that some 6 million African slaves were transported eastwards from West Africa and another ten million were sent westwards to the Americas between the 1500s and 1900s (Beckles, 2002). Beginning 1800s, enslavement of European people, particularly women and girls are begun to be noticed by the term 'white slavery'. According to Kangaspunta (2015), 'white slavery' basically refers to the enslavement of European men and women by the non-white men. Men were usually used as a manual labourer in construction, mining, and plantation, while women were assigned housework or in sexual servitude. Although 'white slavery' encompasses both European men and women, the term is often used to refer to the trafficking of women and girls for sexual exploitation.

In the early 1800s, some countries, especially large nations like the British and the United States began to deploy policies and mechanisms to control the phenomenon of 'white slavery'. For instance, in 1820, the United States passed a law that made the slave trade as a crime which was punishable by a death sentence (Beckles, 2002). As time passed, the momentum to control and prevent the enslavement of white women and girls intensified with many countries start to throw their support. As a result, the International Agreement for the Suppression of White Slave Traffic was sealed in 1904 (Allain, 2017). The main motive of the agreement was to protect European women and girls from becoming a sex slave. After World War I and a birth of the League of Nations, the concept of 'white slave traffic' were changed to 'traffic in women and children' in order to include not only European women and girls but also all women and children with no racial discrimination in a fight against slavery (Gorman, 2008). It is important to note that beginning 1900s, traditional slavery began to be addressed as neo-slavery or as the modern-day slavery. According to Bales, Trodd, and Williamson (2006), human trafficking is often considered as a part and parcel of modern-day slavery due to the similarity in its exploitative nature. They further note that 'modern-day slavery', 'human trafficking', and 'trafficking in person' are umbrella terms used to expound the act of recruiting, transporting, and compelling individuals to provide labour or services involuntarily or against their will. In the closing decade of the twentieth century, human trafficking as a present-day slavery remain as an international problem but has mushroomed in magnitude, owing in large part to the reconstruction of global politics, economy, and social landscape.

Conventionally, the term trafficking was often used to describe the act of kidnapping and enslavement of people, especially for the hard-manual labour as well as for prostitution or the commercial sex industry. However, global development in regard to the phenomenon has caused the international community to adopt a broader definition of trafficking of human beings. This is mirrored in the definition sanctioned by the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) that refers human trafficking as a process of recruiting, transporting, transferring, or harbouring of person by any means which include use of violence, deception, as well as fraudulence to control and exploit them (UNODC, 2004). In this context, trafficking may include various forms of exploitation and not just limited to sexual and labour abuses, but also less known victimization such as child soldiers, trafficking for adoption or begging, as well as for organ trade (Shelley, 2010). Based on the UNODC's definition of human trafficking, the crime can be typically categorized according to few main types of trafficking, namely sex trafficking, forced labour, domestic servitude, and organ trafficking. Sex trafficking may happen when individual(s) uses force, coercion, or deception to cause another individual, particularly women and girls to perform commercial sexual acts unwillingly. The Trafficking Victims Protection Act of 2000 defined sex trafficking as "the recruitment, harbouring, transportation, provision or obtaining of a person for

the purpose of a commercial sex act, in which a commercial sex act is induced by force, fraud or coercion" (Ryf, 2002). Siddharth Kara, in his book 'sex trafficking: inside the business of modern slavery', acknowledged sex trafficking as the most common form of human trafficking in the current world. He further notes that the relationship between trafficking and commercial sexual exploitation has taken different manifestation not only in the form of prostitution but also in pornography, cybersex, as well as sex tourism. Another usual form of trafficking is forced labour or labour exploitation. Forced labour refers to a condition in which individuals are compelled to work through the use of violence and deception, or by more subtle means like debt-bondage, withholding of passport or working permit, as well as retention of salary (Belser, 2005). In other words, labour exploitation is an act of forcing individuals to provide labour or services reluctantly with a restriction on freedom and without proper compensation. Some victims find themselves in circumstances where they have an obligation to pay more to their exploiters that can ever be repaid. This may happen due to the fact that exploiters usually pay the initial transportation, accommodation, and other basic necessities of their workers, overcharging to the point where the individual is unable to leave (Smith & Kangaspunta, 2012). This situation is known as debt-bondage. June Kane, in her chapter in book "human trafficking: interdisciplinary perspectives", outlined the work sectors that commonly harbour victims of forced labour such as in agriculture, construction, manufacturing, mining, restaurants, or other 3D sectors, known as the dirty, dangerous, and difficult jobs.

Another type of trafficking is known as domestic servitude. Domestic servitude is basically a type of forced labour in which individuals are required to live and work within private households. Domestic servants are usually required to perform routine household works such as cleaning, cooking, childcare, and others. The typical norm of live-in service can turn into a trafficking situation when the employer uses violence or other exploitative means to maintain control over their servants and remain working for them (Burke, 2013). According to Hepburn and Simon (2010), when employers confiscate their servant's identification documents as well as travelling papers to prevent them from leaving, it becomes a case of enslavement. Organ trafficking is another type of human trafficking in which individuals are trafficked in order to harvest their organs, tissues or cells and sell them to other individuals who are waiting for transplantation (Budiani-Saberi & Delmonico, 2008). The main consideration of organ trafficking is the commercial negotiation of money and organs, which is regarded as a commodity between the recipients and victims. The 2008 Declaration of Istanbul was the first record that specifically defined organ trafficking. Based on the declaration, organ trafficking can be summarized as "the recruitment, transfer, harbouring of living or deceased individuals by any type of exploitative means for the purpose of organs removal for transplantation" (Delmonico, 2008). In addition to the main types of trafficking, there are few lesser known exploitations in the form of child soldiers and trafficking for adoption as well as for begging. The United Nation's Protocol to Prevent, Suppress, and Punish Trafficking in Persons, note that the act of recruiting and forcing a child to participate in war or armed conflict can be classified under the horizon of trafficking in persons (Tiefenbrun, 2007). While child soldiering is not a new phenomenon, it is still prevalent in many countries that experiencing domestic war due to political, economic, and social instability such as Afghanistan, Democratic Republic of Congo, Mali, South Sudan, Syria, and Yemen (Steinl, 2017). In these countries, children are used as combatants, porters, messengers, cooks or spies by the government forces, paramilitary organizations or rebel groups. Besides, it is also equally important to acknowledge the crime of trafficking for adoption and forced begging. Trafficking for adoption is basically an act of acquiring a child by any means of violence, force, or deception and sell them to individuals looking for adoption. While forced begging is a form of exploitation that may also involve forced

criminal activity. As in many other forms of human trafficking, victims are intimidated with violence or psychologically coerced into begging.

The purpose of this paper is twofold. Firstly, this paper demonstrates the applicability of multiple theories or perspectives in explaining the crime of human trafficking. Secondly, this paper examines various elements and circumstances that facilitate the occurrence of human trafficking in the global context. Generally, the human trafficking literature focused on causal factors, victimization, and policy response, while other aspects such as migration, the market system or the perpetrators involved in the crime are given little attention. Hence, this paper is an attempt to review the existing literature on human trafficking which includes a discussion on the connection between human trafficking and migration, human trafficking as a business enterprise, human trafficking and organized crime, as well as human trafficking from other contexts such as human rights, feminism, and security. A comprehensive understanding of the connection between these aspects would provide fresh insights for knowledge development on the crime of human trafficking. The literature review comprised extensive information collected from 134 books, articles, academic papers, and policy documents with most of them are from the years 2010 and above. The sources are obtained from the university library, online databases such as google scholar, ProQuest, and EBSCOhost.

HUMAN TRAFFICKING AND MIGRATION

Today, one of the major and constantly occurring phenomena around the world is a migration of people. According to Tyagi (2017), migration can be described as "a form of geographical mobility or special mobility between one geographical unit and another or a change in residence from the place of origin or the place of departure to the place of destination or place of arrival". In another word, migration can be typically referred to as the motion of persons from one place to another. In general, individual may decide to migrate from one place to another as a response to their surrounding political, economic, and social changes. Aris Ananta and Evi Nurvidya Arifin, in a book "International migration in Southeast Asia," note that the revolution in a global transportation system and proliferation of mass media as well as other communication technologies have contributed tremendously towards the phenomenon of migration. In addition, fewer restriction on travel such as less control on freedom of movement, cheaper and quicker travelling opportunities have increased the possibility for people to migrate. According to Castles (2000), there are various forms of migration which predominantly depends on the flow, the number of people involved, the motive of their movement, as well as the nature of the movement. In regard to the flow, migration can be either internal or international. Internal migration, also known as a domestic migration, typically involves the movement of individuals within a country and often regarded as a common phenomenon (Skeldon, 2017). The movement of people from rural areas to a city in search of job opportunities is a perfect example of a domestic migration. International or cross-national migration is another type of migration that involve the crossing of national borders. Internal or international migration is both a cause and consequences of globalization and global development processes. Since domestic and international migration is a movement of individuals from one place to another, it could potentially create security concern to both the origin as well as the host country (Wohlfeld, 2014).

In regard to the nature of movement, migration can be classified either as temporary, permanent, voluntary, forced or impelled. Temporary migration is the choice to migrate to another place for a limited or short period of time and usually undertaken for the purpose of leisure, study, business purpose, or even for work (Dustmann & Weiss, 2007). On the other hand, permanent migration is

the choice to migrate to another place and has no plan to return to the origin place. Voluntary migration refers to movement that occurs based on the individual's own desire and free will (Verkuyten, Mepham, & Kros, 2018). Individuals may embark a voluntary migration in the process of seeking better economic and social conditions than the one available at their homeland. It is imperative to note that, in general, voluntary migration does not occur as a result of force or other criminal elements but purely through aspiration and motivation. Involuntary or forced migration occurs when people are made to leave their homeland by any means of coercion or violence. Forced migration is a negative manifestation of relocation which happens due to violence and cruelty or for fear of criminal prosecution (Idris, 2012). According to Martin (2001), forced migration has uprooted or displaced millions of people around the world. Forced migration is often caused and coordinated by someone with authority or power such as government or organized crime groups. People are forced to relocate either because of command or threat. The most renowned case of forced migration in human history was the African slave trade which relocated millions of African from their homeland to different parts of the world, especially the Middle East, Europe, and the Americas (Beckles, 2002). While forced migration is literally forcing individuals in a particular place to relocate, an impelled migration involves the relocation of people due to man or naturally caused situations that make living in their place of origin difficult or challenging. In impelled migration, people are not forced to migrate, but they decide to leave because of some push factors like poverty, war, flooding, diseases, earthquake, or other difficult circumstances (Brown & Bean, 2016). For instance, in 2010, a seven-magnitude earthquake in Haiti caused millions of Haitians homeless and impelled to move to other areas outside of the disaster zone (Concannon & Lindstrom, 2011).

Melissa G. Curley and Wong Siu-lun, in a book "Security and migration in Asia: The dynamics of securitization," stressed that the increasing migration of individuals from one place to another could present challenges and threats to their origin state as well as their host countries. Uncontrolled and uninspected migration can pose potential national and international security threats. Lately, the crime of human trafficking has emerged as a key threat not only to the national or international security, but also the well-being of the human race as a whole. Aronowitz (2009) regards human trafficking as not a single or one-off crime but as a series of process that involves recruitment, transportation, transfer, and control of individuals for various forms of exploitation. The United Nations definition of trafficking encompasses 'transportation' and 'transfer' as an indispensable component of the crime process. Correspondingly, Dimitriadi (2016) acknowledged that migration is an indivisible element of human trafficking and essentially an obligatory phase to initiate exploitation. In the context of human trafficking, movement of individuals from the place of origin to the intended destination can take the forms of voluntary migration as well as forced migration. In the case of voluntary migration, potential victims are often promised of highly paid salary and better living conditions but once they reach their destination, they are exploited in many unimaginable ways. According to Andreatta (2015), most human trafficking victims are initially aspiring migrants who subsequently being trafficked en-route or after they reach their intended destination through any means of fraud, deception, or even violence. In the case of forced movement, individuals who are considered a vulnerable or easy target for human traffickers, for instance, refugees and internally displaced people, are abducted or forced to move to another location for exploitation purpose. Cho (2015)'s analysis of human trafficking determinants showed that while abduction or kidnapping of victims in human trafficking is not unusual, however, a majority of the rescued victims were found to embark a voluntary migration before being exploited.

Since human trafficking and migration are interconnected, both the phenomenon shares the same set of push and pull factor that causes individuals to relocate from one place to another. Tsai and Tsay (2004) stressed that economic consideration is one of the main factors that drive people to migrate to another place in search of better life. The growing inequality of wealth between places or countries certainly magnifies both the push and pull factors that causing individuals to migrate. Besides, the push factors in human trafficking are often negative in context and mostly associated with the conditions in source countries. According to Keo (2014), source countries can be regarded as the states that supply victims for human trafficking market. Source countries are normally characterized as having less robust economies and incompetent to provide sufficient employment opportunities, proper healthcare, or social security due to various reasons but largely related to political instability and constant domestic conflicts (Turek, 2013). On contrary, pull factors tend to be positive in nature and generally associated with conditions in the destination countries. Destination countries are often referred to as the recipient states of trafficked victims and exhibit an opposite set of characteristics that of source countries (Keo, 2014). Human traffickers take leverage of the disparities between the push and pull factors to transport victims from the source countries to the destination countries and generate enormous profits in the transaction. Luty (2010) notes that among the many factors that could increase the risk of victimization is the presence of motivated offenders like organized crime groups. Motivated offenders will target anyone they consider could be valuable for their trafficking activities. Frequently, the perpetrators would prey on aspiring migrants as well as those already residing in the destination country for exploitation purpose. Kimberly A. McCabe, in a book "Human Trafficking: Interdisciplinary Perspectives," explained that many trafficking cases began when aspiring migrants are unable to obtain regular access to the intended destination due to strict immigration policies and rely upon the middlemen or organized crime groups to facilitate their migration. Typically, the perpetrators would promise them of safe passage to the intended destination and then deceive them into exploitative situations.

HUMAN TRAFFICKING AND BUSINESS

Human trafficking has become a thriving criminal market all around the world. Despite international agreement that human trafficking is an illegal and outrageous phenomenon, a dynamic market remain for vulnerable men, women, and children (Flowe, 2010). Issac Ehrlich, in his article "crime, punishment, and the market for offenses", acknowledged that the market of crime, in general, is composed of few important components like the perpetrators, prospective victims, consumers of illegal goods or services, and the law enforcement authorities. He argued that each of these components may interact among one another and act in line with the rules of optimizing behaviour. Furthermore, the action or inaction of these components will affect the overall outcome of a crime market. In the case of human trafficking market, Vlachová (2005) stressed that people are treated like items, who can be bought, sold, and traded for profit. She notes that vulnerable and unprotected individuals are often at risk of being deceived and exploited by human traffickers for labour or services. While victims of human trafficking are often associated with the poor or politically unstable nations, scholars like Salt (2000), Shelley (2010), Newman (2013), and Keo (2014) argued that no countries around the world are practically immune from the phenomenon. In the context of human trafficking, countries can be identified either as a source, transit, or destination countries. Bernat and Zhilina (2011) acknowledged that some countries can be regarded as the source, transit, and destination country at the same time, for instance, Thailand, South Africa, and Canada. According to Vayrynen (2003), trafficked individuals are generally in demand in the destination countries to address shortage of workers, particularly in the industries that prefer cheap and irregular labours. Among the industries that are

considered as a market for trafficked labour are agriculture, manufacturing, electronics, mining, construction, and entertainment. Trafficked victims in these industries face a common set of harms and hazards including dangerous work environment, improper health or medical care, verbal and physical abuses, low and withheld wages, and a general sense of victimization due to being treated as unskilled and easily replaceable (Zimmerman & Kiss, 2017).

Bales (2003) and Flowe (2010) acknowledged that the human trafficking market is nurtured by three significant factors, namely the supply of potential victims for exploitation in the source countries, the constant demand for trafficked victims in the destination countries, and the presence of organized crime groups who act as intermediaries in supplying the victims to the end-users. Scholars like Shelley (2010), O'Brien, Hayes and Carpenter (2013) addressed the many reasons that influence the supply and demand in the human trafficking market. Among the highlighted aspects that determine the supply and demand for trafficked labours are globalization, a decline of border controls, unequal economic development, political elements, domestic or regional conflicts, as well as gender discrimination. Aronowitz and Koning (2014) note that globalization has transformed the elements of supply and demand in several ways. Firstly, the increased competition in business due to economic liberalization had led to global pressure in employers to provide cheap products and at the same time reduce their cost of operating by any means. In order to overcome this challenge, employers often turn to competitive trafficked labours to sustain their operation. Secondly, the decline of border control due to the introduction of free trade and openness of international borders have both contributed positively toward the market of human trafficking (Turek, 2013). Human traffickers often take advantage of the transparent yet porous borders as well as the presence of corrupted enforcement personnel at borders to transport or move their potential victims. Thirdly, Shelley (2010) stressed that the unequal growth and development between countries in a region has created a system with structured exploitation in practically all aspects of people's lives. Disparities in national economies push people to migrate to other countries that offer better prospects, but human traffickers regard the aspiring migrants as a readily available supply of potential victims for their criminal enterprise. Political instability, armed conflicts, and social disorder also influence the supply and demand in the human trafficking market. Cullen-DuPont (2009) argued that in addition to political instability and government's inability to encounter the phenomenon of human trafficking, some government personnel is also known to be complicit in trafficking activities. She regards corruption as one of the intrinsic rationale for the inability of enforcement agencies to contain the market for human trafficking. In regard to gender discrimination, Marxist feminist theory is generally used to describe the unequal preference of men over women in many aspects of living such as education and work. In this view, gender discrimination increases the possibilities for exploitation and likelihood of being trafficked (Bush, 2013).

Rahman (2011) acknowledged that while the element of supply is mostly driven by the aspiring migrant's wish to relocate for better employment opportunities and living conditions, the demand for trafficked workers is propelled by the employers or exploiters' desire to maximize profit. In this context, human traffickers play an intermediary role in connecting the aspiring migrants in the source countries to the employers in the destination countries. Aris Ananta and Evi Nurvidya, in a book "International migration in Southeast Asia," argued that the availability of a large number of potential victims in the trafficking market is not only contributed by feeble economic conditions or political instability in the source countries, but also the presence of middlemen like employment agent and organized crime groups who exploit them in the pretext of facilitating their entry into the intended destination countries. Besides, scholars like Vogel (2017), Mathias and McCabe (2010) also assert that human traffickers are an integral component of the trafficking market who

principally controls both the supply and demand for trafficked labours. However, Keo (2014), Zhang (2009), Gozdziaik and Bump (2008) emphasized the vacuum in the literature about human traffickers as well as a comprehensive analysis of their attributes and characteristics. The reason for this drawback was mostly due to the difficulties in obtaining relevant information from the enforcement authorities and the traffickers themselves, who are typically regarded as the 'hidden population'. On the other hand, Wheaton, Schauer, and Galli (2010) regard the market for human trafficking as monopolistically competitive trade, which is very similar to any other legitimate markets. The only difference is, in the human trafficking market, the product is trafficked victims, the sellers are human traffickers, and the buyers are the employers or end-users. According to Aronowitz (2009), the trade process often began in the source countries, where vulnerable individuals (product) are recruited or 'abducted' into the system by traffickers (seller). Subsequently, the recruited victims are moved to the destination country where employers (buyers) are waiting and exploitation begin for profiteering purpose.

Scholars like Kara (2017) and Oblinger (2015) restressed that even though human trafficking is often implicated to be complex and criminality in nature, however, the phenomenon is also business oriented and profit-driven activity. In fact, several international organizations like United Nations Office of Drugs and Crime (UNODC), International Labour Organizations (ILO), International Organization for Migration (IOM), as well as researchers like Michael (2014), Sheinis (2012), and Shelley (2010) acknowledged human trafficking as the third most luxurious illegal businesses in the globe. The amount of profit generated by human traffickers and exploiters have been a topic of debate among scholars. Keo (2014) and Zhang (2009) argued that the amount of profit claimed by numerous researchers as well as the international organizations are dubious and lack of merit as most of them do not state or detail the data as well as formula used to back their claims. The nature of human trafficking itself presents considerable challenges in establishing a reliable and trustworthy estimation of its profitability. However, in an attempt to provide a logical and a veracious estimation of profits generated from human trafficking activities, Belser (2005) developed a simple formula that postulates profit as equivalence to the value of product minus wages. He further notes that wages or payment for trafficked person are very little, which maximize the profits to the traffickers or exploiters like employers. On the other hand, Aronowitz (2009) notes that the human trafficking business has many features which are quite similar to other legitimate businesses such as organized working attributes, separation of work, proper communication, marketing, and delivery strategies. Even though the traits of the human trafficking business are common across the board, however, the operational mechanism is closely customized according to the market pattern and culture of the region from which they emanate. Shelley, in her book "Human trafficking: A global perspectives," categorized trafficking syndicates as different criminal or business entities according to different regions in the world. She analyzed few different business models of trafficking, namely of Asia (Chinese groups), Eastern and Southern Europe (Balkan and Post-Soviet groups), America (American and Mexican groups), and Africa (Nigerian groups). Shelley's analysis of the various business models in major regions of the world reiterates the fact that trafficking enterprise and its modus operandi are distinct to a particular regional market and there is no comprehensive blanket model that can explain the phenomenon of human trafficking as a whole.

HUMAN TRAFFICKING AND ORGANIZED CRIME

Human trafficking is a phenomenon that has attracted growing global attention and being framed as an activity which typically driven by organized crime groups. Organized crime, in general, is a complex phenomenon and the definition as well as the concept is continuing to

evolve over time. The United Nations Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime (UNCTOC) described organized crime as a structured group of at least 3 persons that prevail for certain duration of time and act in accordance with their main motive of committing crime(s) to gain financial benefits (Boister, 2012). In the context of human trafficking and organized crime, researchers like Caparini (2014), Sheinis (2012), Salt (2000), and Stoecker (2000) regards the two phenomena as closely related. Salt (2000) asserted that the idea is ubiquitous even though there is not much information available to support it. The proposition was based on the fact that most of the trafficking victims are aspiring migrants originated from various places and countries. In order to facilitate their movement and transportation, it requires a substantial amount of money and well-organized groups for the coordination purpose (Caparini, 2014). Hence, there is a vacuum for the participation of criminal syndicates in facilitating the transportation of potential victims from the place or origin to the final destination. Since the link between human trafficking and organized crime is irrefutable, many researchers have acknowledged the significance of addressing the nexus between the two in order to have a comprehensive understanding of the subject matter. Researchers like Aronowitz and Koning (2014), Vayrynen (2003), Williams (2009), as well as Salt and Stein (1997) have extensively deliberated the nexus between human trafficking and organized crime from the various point of views. For instance, Vayrynen (2003) has explained the subject matter from the migration perspective. He notes that irregular or illegal migration, including human trafficking, is part and parcel of the broader issue of organized crime. He points out that when the immigration rules and border control is stringent, the more criminality are used in trafficking activities to bend the barriers. It is typical to assume that the role of criminal groups is omnipresent in irregular or illegal migration. He also discussed the interaction between criminal groups and the state, particularly the enforcement personnel at the borders as well as the element of corruption between officials who in return assist in the movement of potential victims.

While some scholars like Kara (2017), Aronowitz and Koning (2014), as well as Salt and Stein (1997) deliberated human trafficking and organized crime from a business perspective. They argue that the basis of trafficking business is people and organized crime groups act as intermediaries in supplying the demand for cheap labour or services. According to Aronowitz (2009), human trafficking business is a globalized and huge trade, and the organized crime groups are a vital component that presents at different levels of the business. She further notes that any criminal groups which involved in trafficking business often examine the market forces and eventually adapt their modus operandi according to the particular environment. Louise Shelley, in her book "Human trafficking: A global perspectives," acknowledged the different types of criminal organizations involved in the human trafficking business in a different market environment around the world. She stressed that despite the common motives and characteristics of organized crime groups, their modus operandi closely resemble the trading structure as well as the culture of the region from which they emanate. At the same time, some scholars suggested that human trafficking is a lucrative business posing little risk to the perpetrators. Kara (2017) stated that similar to any other legitimate or illegitimate businesses, human trafficking is a profit-driven activity. The profits from the trafficking business are immense. According to the International Labour Office (2014), human trading is estimated to generate US\$150.2 billion in annual profits. However, the alleged profitability of trafficking is based on estimation or mere suggestion as most available studies relied upon non-empirical literature and unofficial reports (Keo, 2014). In part, this deficiency is due to complication experienced during data collection from the relevant authorities as well as from the organized crime groups themselves. Nevertheless, Sarkar (2015) and Shelley (2010) stated that the huge profit from human trafficking is mainly used for the operational purpose as well as investment in the development of other legal or illegal businesses. They note

that most organized crime groups invest their profit from human trade in order to enjoy the 'cleansed money' with little concern of being confiscated by the authority.

Some scholars like Burke (2013), Shelley (2010), Aronowitz, Theuermann and Tyurykanova (2010), as well as Vlachova (2005) contributed to the literature of human trafficking and organized crime by analyzing and explaining the diversity of actors involved in the crime as well as their roles and responsibilities. According to Aronowitz, Theuermann and Tyurykanova (2010), it was inaccurate to argue that all trafficking activities were under the control of organized crime groups. They claimed that there are many amateurs consist of individual traffickers and small groups of criminals who involved in the trafficking business. Shelley (2010) notes that the obligation to trafficking as an activity varies among criminal actors. She stressed while some traffickers are opportunists who will commit any illegal activities to make a profit, some other are facilitators who may be involved at various stages of trafficking on an ad-hoc basis. Vlachova, in her article "Trafficking in human: The slavery of our age," regards the perpetrators that involved in trafficking activities as complex since it includes chains of individuals as well as legitimate business establishments. Individuals like recruiters, middlemen, pimps, employers, and various business establishments such as employment bureaus, transport agencies, hotels, night-clubs, and massage parlours often communicate with each another to form complex trafficking networks. These individuals typically have specific roles and responsibilities in the trafficking process. Vlachova (2005) further notes that the complex and diverse chain of individuals enables the organized crime groups to be adaptable to various changes in the human trafficking market. According to Crawford (2010), in some cases, even family members are known to cahoots with the criminal groups in trafficking of their children. Due to a promise of huge financial rewards, some family members are believed to trade their own children to the trafficking syndicate. On the other hand, some scholars like Kane (2013), Shelley (2010), Aronowitz (2009), and Saat (2009) contributed on the literature of human trafficking and organized crime by deliberating the details of the perpetrators' modus operandi. The researchers explained that, in general, human trafficking is a process consists of different stages like recruitment, transportation, harbouring, and exploitation. Within each stage, different criminal groups operate differently according to their market environment. Even though the different criminal organizations may have different operational styles, however, the trafficking process typically begin with the recruitment of potential victims through non-violence means such as fake job advertisement or false promises of marriage as well as through violence means like kidnapping (Keo, 2014). According to Aronowitz, Theuermann and Tyurykanova (2010), most of the recruitment method employed by human traffickers involve non-violence means. They argue that coercion and force were not required because most victims were often deprived and lack the knowledge to realize that they were in a deceptive situation. After recruitment, the potential victims are transported, legally or illegally, either via air, land or sea depending on the suitability and cost. Once the victims have reached their intended destination, the perpetrators begin their exploitation through various violence and non-violence means.

Some scholars advanced the literature of human trafficking and organized crime by deliberating the diversity in the organization of criminal syndicates involved in the trafficking. Numerous typologies and analytical models have been developed to explain the different types of human traffickers or criminal syndicates involved in trafficking. Aronowitz (2009) states the organizational arrangement of human traffickers can range from individual traffickers with links to criminal groups to highly organized criminal syndicates. She explained that the arrangement of criminal syndicates involved in trafficking differs in size, the degree of specialization, and the scale of their operation. While Englund (2008) acknowledged that the organization of criminal syndicates can be generally categorized according to their scale of operation, either as small, medium or large

trafficking organizations. Similar to Aronowitz (2009), Englund argues that criminal syndicates may vary in structure, levels of the organization, and their modus operandi. Vy Le, in her article "Organized crime typologies: Structure, activities, and conditions," acknowledged that the various forms of analytical models to analyze criminal organizations in literature can be generally categorized into three principal types, namely models that focus on the physical arrangement and modus operandi of the organization, model that focus of the activities of the organization, as well as models that focus on the socio-cultural aspects which facilitate organized crime activities. Firstly, models that focus on the physical arrangement and modus operandi of crime groups inclined to analyze the configuration of crime groups either as a hierarchy, network, or hybrid form. Based on the empirical study of human trafficking syndicates in different countries, the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) developed five distinct types of models. There are 'standard hierarchy' which consists of a single hierarchically structured organization with a well-defined authority; the 'regional hierarchy' which is composed of ranking system within organization but with some self-governing aspects; the 'clustered hierarchy' which is composed of a few smaller criminal groups that operate under control and coordination of a central body; the 'core group' which consists of unorganized criminal groups that are surrounded by a larger network of associate members; and the 'criminal network' which is composed of a loose network of criminals aligned together in the trafficking activity. Each of these models has different levels of complexity, authority, a division of labour, and communication patterns.

Secondly, models that focus on the activities of organized crime groups attempt to analyze the objectives as well as the different forms of criminal activities committed by a criminal group. Since the motive of most organized crime groups is to make a profit, models in this category are also likely to be economic or business models (Le, 2012). As mentioned in the earlier part of this literature review, Shelley (2010) has deliberated in detail about the different types of criminal enterprises or business models of traffickers. Among the models analyzed were 'trade and development model', 'natural resource model', 'violent entrepreneur model', 'American pimp model', 'supermarket model', and 'traditional slavery with modern technology model'. Thirdly, models that focus on the socio-cultural aspects analyzes organized crime groups based on their socio-cultural identity. According to Aronowitz (2009), some trafficking groups recruit and operate their illegal trading on the basis of their culture and ethnicity. Hence, organized crime groups in this category are typically identifiable through their ethnicity, for example, Italian mafia, Japanese yakuza, Vietnamese gangs, and Chinese triads. On the other hand, Phil Williams, in a book "Networks and Netwars: The future of terror, crime, and militancy," note there is a growing acknowledgement among researchers that organized crime is progressively operating through a loose network structure in preference of a rigid hierarchy. According to the conventional paradigm, organized crime groups were thought to comprise of hierarchical, ethnic-based, and tightly structured organization. However, in addition to the conventional structures, some scholars like Aronowitz (2009), Chatterjee (2005), and Monzini (2004) highlighted that many organized crime groups involved in human trafficking as fluid and loosely organized. The emphasis on fluid criminal networks displays a growing acknowledgement among researchers that there is no dominant organizational structure with universal applicability. Hence, Phil Williams created an experimental network typology comprising of four types of model, namely 'directed network', 'mesh network', 'transactional network', and 'flux network' (Le, 2012). He notes that each of the models differs in term of arrangement and its functions. At the same time, there is a researcher like Xia (2008) who highlighted the hybrid typologies of organized crime which incorporate both the hierarchical and network models. She argues that the motive behind the development of hybrid models is because they attempt to cover a wider spectrum of organized crime structures which may change due to evolving politic, social, and market environment. Contrarily, despite the development of various

analytical models to analyze organized crime groups, Le (2012) argues that only a handful of them was used in academic, while the rest remains untested. As a result, the information about human traffickers or organized crime groups are still scarce despite the many existing studies on human trafficking and organized crime.

HUMAN TRAFFICKING FROM OTHER PERSPECTIVES

Human trafficking gained substantial scrutiny in the early twenty-first century alongside drugs and arms trafficking as one of the major threats to global security. According to Lee (2011), national and regional understanding and response to the crime of human trafficking has amplified the phenomenon from a domestic security issue to the global agenda of high politics. In this context, international organizations like United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC), International Organization of Migration (IOM), International Labour Organization (ILO), as well as many prominent scholars like Aronowitz and Koning (2014), Chibba (2014), Shelley (2010), and Obokata (2006) have researched and debated the phenomenon of human trafficking from diverse disciplines and perspectives such as migration, economics, human rights, feminism, security, and transnational organized crime. With this in mind, this section of the literature review examines various deliberation of human trafficking, particularly from the domain of human rights, feminism, and security. Firstly, the human rights perspective, which is also known as the 'victim-centered approach,' is popular and among the frequently used premise to discuss human trafficking issues. The concept of human rights has appeared from the notion of rights. Karl Marx regard rights as equity of all human beings and explained how rights are misused in politics, economy, and society for certain individual's benefit (Chaman, 2017). Jack Donnelly, in his book "Universal human rights in theory and practice," acknowledged that human rights are a basic standard of civilization and universal in nature, where every individual in the world are entitled with the fundamental rights for freedom of life. This assertion has been emulated in the various legal conventions and declarations like the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and International Covenant on Civil and Economics Rights, which congregates the centerpiece of a moral doctrine of human rights. According to Farrokhzad (2017), Aransiola and Zarowsky (2014), human rights-based approach to human trafficking stands on the idea that trafficking is root as well as the consequences of human rights violation. They stressed that trafficking of human beings has undermined the individual's right to freedom, employment, health, as well as highlighted the need to support the trafficked victims instead of degrading them as criminals.

Scholars like Chaman (2017), Rijken (2009), and Obokata (2006) acknowledged that a human rights domain is often used in the human trafficking studies to deliberate the social inequalities among people around the world. According to Barner, Okech and Camp (2014), the United Nations have classified social inequalities into six comprehensive categories, namely inequalities in the distribution of income, employment, assets or facilities, political inequalities, inequalities in access to education or knowledge, and inequalities in access to medical care, social security as well as safety. Obokata (2006) stated that social inequalities are the common cause of human trafficking. Social polarity fuel human trafficking because traffickers often target vulnerabilities. Human traffickers typically look for individuals who live in poverty, those who are desperate to migrate due to lack of opportunities in employment or education, as well as those who look for ways to escape domestic violence. Another interlinked cause of trafficking is the discrimination of people based on gender and race. Watson and Silkston (2006) regard the phenomenon of human trafficking as highly gender-based violence. Even though male constitutes a large number of trafficked victims for labour exploitation, however, the majority of the identified trafficked person around the world is women and girls (UNODC, 2006). According to Masika (2002), unequal

gender relations and biased patriarchal system are the main causes for this scenario. In many human trafficking cases, particularly sex trafficking, gender discrimination has been argued as one of the major factors behind the cause of trafficking. Several scholars have analyzed human trafficking issues with gender discrimination as the main deliberation point. Among them are Herzfeld (2002), Poudel and Smyth (2002), and Dottridge (2002) who discussed the various aspects of gender inequalities that led to trafficking in different cultural settings and countries. Besides, Bryant-Davis and Tummala-Narra (2017) highlighted the cultural oppression, especially racism and ethnic partiality, which create further risk of victimization. Butler (2015) and Pandya and Pandya (2011) argued that while the existing literature does not provide much explanation about the nexus between trafficking and racism, they are nonetheless undeniable. The researchers contended that racism and ethnic partiality continue to manifest in many contemporary conflicts and played a significant role in precipitating the epidemic of human trafficking all around the world.

On the other hand, scholars like Kaye and Winterdyk (2012), Duger (2011), Wijers (2004), and Derks (2000) acknowledged that a human rights domain has also been regularly used in the human trafficking studies as an instrument to address the rights of a trafficked person. Given the serious human rights abuses inflicted on trafficked persons. Duger (2011) argued that human rights or a victim-centered approach in academic research as well as policy decision can help improve analysis and response towards human trafficking cases. While international law and regulations like the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR) and the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (CERD) creates constructive legal commitments or responsibilities for international communities to follow, Farrokhzad (2017) stressed that a rights-based approach can also be used to critique current norms and transform the comprehension of human trafficking issues from a victim's point of view. Researchers like Budiani-Saberi and Columb (2013) and Rijken and Volder (2009) are among the few who highlighted the lack of policy responses in addressing the rights of the trafficked victims. They argue that the conventional actions and activities to address human trafficking has primarily been a criminal justice response and aimed at the prevention of crime as well as the prosecution of traffickers and exploiters. The protection of the rights of victims has been mostly neglected. The researchers also pointed out the importance of a human rights-based approach in tackling the phenomenon of human trafficking more comprehensively, with equal focus on the prosecution of traffickers, the protection of victims, as well as the prevention efforts. Besides, the incorporation of a human rights domain in human trafficking studies also highlighted the significant roles of government and civil society organizations in implementing as well as enforcing the rights of trafficked victims. Diriwari (2016), Gauri and Gloppen (2012) deliberated the roles and responsibilities of relevant authorities in raising moral pressure and educating all stakeholders in ensuring fundamental human rights are respected and observed.

Another important theoretical framework that is often employed in human trafficking studies is feminist theories. Merriam (2005) regards the feminist theory as a multidisciplinary domain that attempts to apprehend the roles and value of individuals based on gender. According to Nichols (2013), Sokoloff and Dupant (2005), feminist theories are usually used in research pertaining to violence or gender-based crime, particularly the one that oppressed women and girls. In the context of human trafficking, Deshpande and Nour (2013), Masika (2002), and Vermeulen (2001) note human trafficking as a crime that often associated with women because they are more vulnerable to being exploited. In other words, the explanation of human trafficking is typically focused on women's discrimination and the feminization of trafficking. This may due to the fact that almost 71% of trafficked victims globally are women and girls (UNODC, 2006). Lara Gerassi, in

her article "A heated debate: Theoretical perspectives of sexual exploitation and sex work," argued that most conventional theories have failed to acknowledge the unique experiences that women face, and feminist perspectives leverage on that uniqueness to deliberate the trafficking issues in most appropriate ways. According to Charlesworth and Chinkin (2000), women all around the world face some level of discrimination in regard to politics, economy, social, as well as culture. Men are commonly favoured over women in many aspects of life. This subjection functions at the different levels of social settings, let it be at the family, regional, national or even international context. As a result, the feminist school of thought becomes one of the suitable domains in the study of social issues and crime like human trafficking. In general, feminist approaches have divided scholars and advocates into two opposing theoretical camps, namely neo-abolitionist and sex positivist. Scholars like MacKinnon (2011), Farley (2006), Hughes (2000), and Barry (1984) are among the few researchers who have adopted neo-abolitionist domain in their arguments. Barry, in her book "Female sexual slavery," regards female sexual slavery is both prostitution and trafficking in women. She further notes that the root of trafficking is sexual supremacy and the only mechanism to combat trafficking in women is to stop women's oppression. According to Hughes (2000), trafficking in women is related to the issue of supply and demand in the sex industry. She argued when there is a demand for sexual services, vulnerable women are victimized and exploited to fulfill the need. The neo-abolitionist perspective stated that no women could ever willingly choose to prostitute herself. Instead, they are exploited by some unscrupulous individuals for profit.

On definition, some feminist neo-abolitionist like MacKinnon (2011) and Farley (2006) equate prostitution with sex trafficking, arguing that all type of commercial sex is cruelty against women. The neo-abolitionists often focused their argument on the suppressing sociocultural values and economic circumstances which led to the victimization of women. In other words, the gendered explanation of human trafficking by neo-abolitionist often focused on the inequalities in society. Scholars like Gerassi (2015), Kalra and Bhugra (2013) regard issues of violence against women as a part and parcel of structural sexism and paternalistic views, which note that savagery against women is an intrinsic manifestation of men's supremacy and social control over women. The researchers argued that the violence against women occurs mainly because of conventionalized male privileges, causing a deprivation of women's fundamental social right which exposes them to exploitation. Kara (2017), Kaye and Winterdyk (2012) acknowledged that in societies where the socio-cultural values of patriarchy are upheld, the position of women in the family, as well as the community, are devalued. In such settings, women are ascribed as a second-class citizen and are not accorded with the same rights and autonomy as men. The unfortunate status creates gender-based inequality and discrimination in society, which eventually led to the event of victimization. Alexis Aronowitz, in a book "Human trafficking, human misery: The global trade in human beings," stressed that human traffickers often target vulnerable individuals like women and girls and frequently capitalize on their desire to change or migrate for better lives. In addition to patriarchal norms, some scholars like Acker (2004) also argued that globalization and the capitalist market system have also disproportionately affected women. The researchers state the capitalist market system has created imbalance and prejudice as many economic sectors prefer cheap labours for profit maximization. Unfortunately, human trafficking is a typical by-product of a capitalist market system because people, particularly women and girls can be easily drawn into exploitative situations.

On the other hand, scholars like Sanghera (2012), Davidson (2002), and Kempadoo (1998) argued women have all the rights to work in any economic sectors that they wish, including prostitution or sex work. Different from the neo-abolitionist perspective, sex positivists champion the women's

right to choose sex work as their profession. Feminist in this camp regard prostitution or other sex work as a form of labour as well as a mean for women to earn and survive. Sex positivists disagree with a notion of neo-abolitionists that all kind of sex work and prostitution is an act of exploitation or trafficking. According to Sanghera (2012), a grouping of all women that work as a prostitute or in commercial sex establishment under the umbrella of trafficked victims is just not right and fundamentally denies their right to freedom as well as to make own decisions. She further stressed that women have the right to move from one place to another in search of better life and employment without any prejudice. Some other sex positivists like Skrobaneck, Boonpakdi, and Janthakeero (1997) argued that trafficking in women is a structural problem and note trafficking can only exist when the element of deception, force, and violence is present. Shah (2007) states that globalization and systemic inequalities are the main reason that has distorted the lives of many women from marginalized communities, especially by feminizing poverty and migration. According to Chant (2009), the feminization of poverty is frequently understood as an undue overrepresentation of women than men in poverty. The feminization of poverty occurs as a result of many circumstances such as unemployment or lack of income, deprivation of capabilities and gender-biased policies that present in general society as well as in the government. In most cases, migration has become an option for survival and as a consequence, women are placed in a vulnerable position which makes them highly susceptible to exploitation. Sex positivists suggest that in order to combat the crime of human trafficking, first and foremost, the government or relevant authorities need to address the fundamental structural problem associated with traffickings like poverty and unequal treatment or gender-biased policies. Besides, scholars like Santos, Gomes and Duarte (2010) argue that counter-trafficking measures should prioritize on handling the human rights violations that happen in many employment or economic sectors rather than just seeking to suppress sex industry or prohibiting women to work in sex enterprises.

Besides human rights and feminist outlook, a security domain is another important and generally employed approach in human trafficking studies. According to Iroanya (2018), security is a wide concept that has two intrinsic characteristics, namely threat and vulnerability. While threats are typically referred to as identifiable and visible dangers to a state and society, vulnerability is regarded as a potential risk that often does not provide a clear policy response. He stressed that if the vulnerability is left unchecked over time, it can also become a threat. Scholars like Chibba (2014), Giguere (2013), and Friensedorf (2009) discussed the various consequences of human trafficking on the socio-economic development as well as other security matters at national, regional, global, and individual levels. Their arguments were focused on explaining the security implications of human trafficking and how they can be best addressed. For instance, Giguere (2013) and Friensedorf (2009) stressed that human trafficking has undermined the security of national as well as international borders. They argued that the trafficking activities placed border security at stake due to the presence of corruption and organized crime. Even though human trafficking is commonly regarded as an underground activity, it appears that corruption and immigration fraud were involved at different stages of trafficking. This is mainly to assist traffickers to move their victims into the intended destinations without any problem. According to Chibba (2014), human trafficking also undermined national security as the crime has been linked to be a source of funding for organized crime groups. Given the huge profits that can be generated through trafficking in human beings, it is, therefore an enticement for individuals or criminal organizations to get involved in the national or transnational crimes. Organized crime groups are generally known to use violence or various other illegal means to achieve their motives. Hence, it is argued that human trafficking has a direct bearing on national as well as international security. On top of national and international security, Radeva, Trossero, and Pluim (2009) argued that trafficking also threatens human security, with trafficked people being physically and

psychologically abused. Human security is often addressed in the human rights discussion, which focused on the individual's right to freedom and safety from bodily harm.

On the other hand, some scholars like Uddin (2014), Mattar (2006), and Clark (2003) deliberated the issue of security in human trafficking by analyzing the various conditions of vulnerability. The researchers are in the opinion that by highlighting the various types of situations of vulnerabilities, it may assist relevant authorities in identifying potential dangers that could lead to situations of trafficking as well as in formulating appropriate policy responses to address the areas of insecurity. According to Mattar (2006), among the common conditions of vulnerability is poverty or economic insecurity, social and cultural insecurity, legal insecurity, and the entrenchment of organized crime groups. These are the typical conditions that have been extensively highlighted and discussed in the literature. Besides, scholars like William (2009) and Friensedorf (2009) acknowledged the importance of addressing the causes of insecurity and taking the necessary actions to combat the phenomenon. These researchers have incorporated security domain in the human trafficking studies mainly to suggest the best possible ways to prohibit victimization as well as trafficking in human beings. Moreover, the researchers also highlighted the need for cooperation among a wide range of stakeholders, including law enforcement agency, the private sectors, civil society, and individual citizens. On the other hand, Friensedorf (2009) also utilized a security domain to analyze and deliberate the role of security actors. He stressed that security actors like police, border guards, prosecutors, and judge have two important obligations; first, is to help in the fight against human trafficking and second, is to protect the victims of the crime. He further argued that some security actors may complicit with the traffickers which ultimately showed their failure in protecting the innocent. While some other security actors are simply not equipped to recognize trafficked persons as victims and often mistake them for illegal migrant or freelance prostitute (Aronowitz, 2010).

CONCLUSION

The literature review revealed a great deal of interest among the academic community in analyzing the crime of human trafficking from multidisciplinary perspectives. In particular, scholars and experts have deliberated the link between irregular migration and human trafficking. They stressed that migration is fundamentally an obligatory step in initiating the trafficking of human beings and subsequently exploitation in the various employment sectors, especially in the dirty, dangerous and difficult (3D) sectors such as construction, manufacturing, and agriculture. The scholars further note that economic factors are one of the main catalysts that drive people to migrate to another destination in search of better jobs or living opportunities. However, human traffickers take advantage of the vulnerabilities by recruiting and transporting the aspiring migrants to the destination countries before exploiting them for profit. On the other hand, the market system of human trafficking is another perspective that received less attention from the academic community. Nevertheless, the existing literature indicated that, like any other legitimate or illegitimate businesses, the phenomenon of human trafficking is driven by the element of supply and demand. In this context, trafficking victims are treated like items, who can be bought, sold, and traded for profit. The supply of potential victims in the source countries and the demand for victims in the destination countries are interrelated and considered as integral components of the trafficking market. These two components are controlled by the human traffickers who play an intermediary role in connecting the potential victims in the source countries to the employers or exploiters in the destination countries. Overall, the literature signifies the crime of human trafficking as a business-oriented and profit-driven activity. Besides, the existing literature also contributed to

the body of knowledge by linking human trafficking to organized crime. The literature has indicated the different types of criminal organizations involved in the crime of human trafficking in different parts of the world. Moreover, the literature also acknowledged the diversity of perpetrators involved in human trafficking as well as their modus operandi. Last but not least, it is equally important to acknowledge some of the limitations in the existing literature on human trafficking. First, the nature of human trafficking is almost similar to the crime of human smuggling and unfortunately, some human trafficking studies have mixed-up the attributes and modus operandi of the latter. Besides, there are claims that many of the existing human trafficking studies are based on assumption or unreliable data. Researchers like Keo (2014) and Zhang (2009) acknowledged that the lack of empirical studies on human trafficking may be due to the difficulties in collecting data or information from relevant stakeholders by the researchers. Finally, most of the existing human trafficking literature are based on 'western-centric' approaches, and therefore it might not illustrate the real situation in the non-western countries.

REFERENCES

- Abramova, S. U. (1979). Ideological, Doctrinal, Philosophical, Religious and Political Aspects of the African Slave Trade. In UNESCO (Ed.), *The African Slave Trade from the Fifteenth to the Nineteenth Century* (pp. 16-30). Paris: Imprimeries Réunies de Chambéry.
- Acker, J. (2004). Gender, Capitalism and Globalization. *Critical Sociology*, 30(1), 17–41.
- Allain, J. (2017). White Slave Traffic in International Law. *Journal of Trafficking and Human Exploitation*, 1(1), 1-40.
- Ananta, A. & Arifin, E. N. (2004). Should Southeast Asian Borders be Opened?" In A. Ananta & E. N. Arifin (Eds.), *International Migration in Southeast Asia* (pp. 1-27). Singapore: Institute of Southeast Asian Studies.
- Andreatta, C. (2015, January). *Protection, Assistance and Social (re)Integration of Human Trafficking Survivors: A Comparative Analysis of Policy Approaches and Practices in the UK and in Italy*. Working Paper No. 2 for Centre for Social Justice and Change, University of East London, London.
- Aransiola, J. & Zarowsky, C. (2014). Human Trafficking and Human Rights Violations in South Africa: Stakeholders' Perceptions and The Critical Role of Legislation. *African Human Rights Law Journal*, 14, 519-520.
- Aronowitz, A. A. (2010). Overcoming the Challenges to Accurately Measuring the Phenomenon of Human Trafficking. *International Review of Penal Law*, 81(3), 493-511.
- Aronowitz, A. A. (2009). *Human Trafficking, Human Misery: The Global Trade in Human Beings*. Westport, CT: Praeger Publishers.
- Aronowitz, A. A. & Koning, A. (2014). Understanding Human Trafficking as a Market System: Addressing The Demand Side of Trafficking For Sexual Exploitation. *Revue internationale de droit penal*, 85(3), 669-696.

- Aronowitz, A. A., Theuermann, G., & Tyurykanova, E. (2010). *Analysing the Business Model of Trafficking in Human Beings to Better Prevent the Crime*. Vienna: OSCE Office of the Special Representative and Co-ordinator for Combating Trafficking in Human Beings.
- Bales, K. (2003, July). *Understanding the Demand Behind Human Trafficking*. Paper presented at the National Institute of Justice, Washington DC.
- Bales, K., Trodd, Z., & Williamson, A. K. (2006). *Modern Slavery: The Secret World of 27 Million People*. Oxford, UK: Oneworld Publications.
- Barner, J. R., Okech, D., & Camp, M. A. (2014). Socio-Economic Inequality, Human Trafficking, and the Global Slave Trade. *Societies*, 4, 148-160.
- Barry, K. (1984). *Female Sexual Slavery*. New York, NY: NYU Press.
- Beckles, H. M. (2002). *Slave Voyages: The Transatlantic Trade in Enslaved Africans*. Paris: United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization.
- Belser, P. (2005, March). *Forced Labour and Human Trafficking: Estimating the Profits* (Working paper no. 42 in Special Action Programme to Combat Forced Labour). Geneva: International Labour Organization.
- Bernat, F. & Zhilina, T. (2011). Human Trafficking: The Locals Become Global. In F. P. Bernat (Ed.), *Human Sex Trafficking* (pp. 1-8). New York, NY: Routledge.
- Boister, Neil. (2012). *An Introduction to Transnational Criminal Law*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Brown, S. K. & Bean, F. D. (2016). Conceptualizing Migration: From Internal/International to Kinds of Membership. In M. J. White (Ed.), *International Handbook of Migration and Population Distribution* (pp. 91-108). New York City, NY: Springer.
- Bryant-Davis, T. & Tummala-Narra, P. (2017). Cultural Oppression and Human Trafficking: Exploring the Role of Racism and Ethnic Bias. *Women & Therapy*, 40(1-2), 152-169.
- Budiani-Saberi, D. A. & Columb, S. (2013). A Human Rights Approach to Human Trafficking for Organ Removal. *Medicine, Health Care and Philosophy*, 16(4), 897-914.
- Budiani-Saberi, D. A. & Delmonico, F. L. (2008). Organ Trafficking and Transplant Tourism: A Commentary On the Global Realities. *American Journal of Transplantation*, 8(5), 925-929.
- Burke, M. C. (2013). *Human Trafficking: Interdisciplinary Perspectives*. New York: Routledge.
- Bush, M. A. (2013). Afghanistan and the Sex Trade. In M. C. Burke (Ed.), *Human Trafficking: Interdisciplinary Perspectives* (pp. 111-117). New York, NY: Routledge.
- Butler, C. N. (2015). The Racial Roots of Human Trafficking. *UCLA Law Review*, 62(1464), 1466-1513.

- Caparini, M. (2014). Human Trafficking and Organized Crime. In W. Hofmeister & P. Rueppel (Eds.), *Trafficking in Human Beings: Learning from Asian and European Experiences* (pp. 11-23). Singapore: Konrad Adenauer Stiftung, East Asian Institute, and European Policy Centre.
- Castles, S. (2000). International Migration at the Beginning of the Twenty-First Century: Global Trends and Issues. *International Social Science Journal*, 52(165), 269-281.
- Chaman, S. R. C. (2017). Human Rights and Trafficking in Women and Children in India. *Journal of Historical Archaeology & Anthropological Sciences*, 1(5), 162–170.
- Chant, S. (2009). The 'Feminisation of Poverty' in Costa Rica: To What Extent a Conundrum? *Bulletin of Latin American Research*, 28(1), 19–43.
- Charlesworth, H. & Chinkin, C. (2000). *The Boundaries of International Law*. Manchester: Juris Publishing.
- Chatterjee, J. (2005). *The Changing Structure of Organized Crime Groups*. Paper prepared for Royal Canadian Mounted Police, Canada.
- Chibba, M. (2014). Understanding Human Trafficking: Perspectives from Social Science, Security Matters, Business and Human Rights. *Contemporary Social Science*, 9(3), 311-321.
- Cho, S. Y. (2015). Modeling for Determinants of Human Trafficking: An Empirical Analysis. *Social Inclusion*, 3(1), 2-21.
- Clark, M. A. (2003). Trafficking in Persons: An Issue of Human Security. *Journal of Human Development*, 4(2), 247-263.
- Concannon, B. & Lindstrom, B. (2011). Cheaper, Better, Longer-Lasting: A Rights-Based Approach to Disaster Response in Haiti. *Emory International Law Review*, 25, 1145-1191.
- Crawford, M. (2010). *Sex Trafficking in South Asia: Telling Maya's Story*. London: Routledge.
- Cullen-DuPont, K. (2009). *Global Issues: Human Trafficking*. New York, NY: Infobase Publishing.
- Curley, M. G. & Siu-lun, W. (2008). Applying Securitization Theory to Unregulated Migration in Asia. In M. G. Curley & W. Siu-lun (Eds.), *Security and Migration in Asia: The Dynamics of Securitization* (pp. 3-18). New York, NY: Routledge.
- Davidson, J. O. (2002). The Rights and Wrongs of Prostitution. *Hypatia*, 17(2), 84-98.
- Delmonico, F. L. (2008). The Declaration of Istanbul on Organ Trafficking and Transplant Tourism. *Indian Journal of Nephrology*, 18(3), 135–140.
- Derks, A. (2000). *Combating Trafficking in South-East Asia: A Review of Policy and Programme Responses*. Geneva: The International Organization for Migration.
- Deshpande, N. A. & Nour, N. M. (2013). Sex Trafficking of Women and Girls. *Reviews in Obstetrics & Gynecology*, 6(1), 22-27.

- Dimitriadi, A. (2016). The Interrelationship Between Trafficking and Irregular Migration. In S. Carrera & E. Guild (Eds.), *Irregular Migration, Trafficking and Smuggling of Human Beings: Policy Dilemmas in The EU* (pp. 64-69). Brussels: Centre for European Policy Studies.
- Diriwari, W. O. (2016). Efficacy of the Legal Frameworks for Child Protection in Nigeria (Doctoral dissertation). Retrieved from <https://bura.brunel.ac.uk/bitstream/2438/14781/1/FulltextThesis.pdf>
- Donnelly, J. (2013). *Universal Human Rights in Theory and Practice* (3rd ed.). Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press.
- Dottridge, M. (2002). Trafficking in Children in West and Central Africa. *Gender and Development*, 10(1), 38-42.
- Duger, A. (2011). Focusing on Prevention: The Social and Economic Rights of Children Vulnerable to Sex Trafficking. *Health and Human Rights Journal*, 11(1), 114-123.
- Dustmann, C. & Weiss, Y. (2007). Return Migration: Theory and Empirical Evidence from the UK. *British Journal of Industrial Relations*, 45(2), 236-256.
- Ehrlich, I. (1996). Crime, Punishment, and The Market for Offenses. *Journal of Economic Perspectives*, 10(1), 43-67.
- Englund, C. (2008). *The Organisation of Human Trafficking: A Study of Criminal Involvement in Sexual Exploitation in Sweden, Finland and Estonia*. Stockholm: The Swedish National Council for Crime Prevention.
- Evans, C. & Rydén, G. (2008). Voyage Iron: An Atlantic Slave Trade Currency, its European Origins, and West African Impact. *Past & Present*, 239(1), 41-70.
- Farley, M. (2006). Prostitution, Trafficking, and Cultural Amnesia: What We Must Not Know in Order To Keep the Business of Sexual Exploitation Running Smoothly. *Yale Journal of Law & Feminism*, 18(1), 109-144.
- Farrokhzad, A. (2017). Human Trafficking: A Human Rights Oriented Approach. *International Law Research*, 6(1), 132-137.
- Flowe, M. (2010). The International Market for Trafficking in Persons for the Purpose of Sexual Exploitation: Analyzing Current Treatment of Supply and Demand. *North Carolina Journal of International Law and Commercial Regulation*, 35(3), 671-721.
- Friesendorf, C. (2009). Introduction: The Security Sector and Counter-Trafficking. In C. Friesendorf (Ed.), *Strategies Against Human Trafficking: The Role of the Security Sector* (pp. 17-32). Vienna: National Defence Academy.
- Gauri, V. & Gloppen, S. (2012, January). *Human Rights Based Approaches to Development: Concepts, Evidence, and Policy*. Policy Research Working Paper 5938 for World Bank, Washington DC.

- Gerassi, L. (2015). A Heated Debate: Theoretical Perspectives of Sexual Exploitation and Sex Work. *Journal of sociology and social welfare*, 42(4), 79-100.
- Giguere, J. (2013). Human Trafficking: A Security Perspective. *International Affairs Review*, 21 (2), 2-21.
- Gorman, D. (2008). Empire, Internationalism, and the Campaign against the Traffic in Women and Children in the 1920s. *Twentieth Century British History*, 19(2), 186–216.
- Gozdziak, E. M. & Bump, M. N. (2008, October). *Data and Research on Human Trafficking: Bibliography of Research-Based Literature*. Paper prepared for Institute for the Study of International Migration, Georgetown University, Washington DC.
- Hepburn, S. & Simon, R. J. (2010). Hidden in Plain Sight: Human Trafficking in the United States. *Gender Issues*, 27(1), 1-26.
- Herzfeld, B. (2002). Slavery and Gender: Women's Double Exploitation. *Gender and Development*, 10(1), 50-55.
- Hughes, D. M. (2000). The 'Natasha' Trade: The Transnational Shadow Market of Trafficking in Women. *Journal of International Affairs*, 53(2), 625-651.
- Idris, A. (2012). Malaysia and Forced Migration. *Intellectual Discourse*, 20(1), 31-54.
- International Labour Office. (2014). *Profits and Poverty: The Economics of Forced Labour*. Geneva: Author.
- Iroanya, R. O (2018). *Human Trafficking and Security in Southern Africa: The South African and Mozambican Experience*. Switzerland: Springer International Publishing AG.
- Kalra, G. & Bhugra, D. (2013). Sexual Violence Against Women: Understanding Cross-Cultural Intersections. *Indian Journal of Psychiatry*, 55(3), 244–249.
- Kane, J. (2013). Making Money out of Misery: Trafficking for Labor Exploitation. In M. C. Burke (Ed.), *Human Trafficking: Interdisciplinary Perspectives* (pp. 109-132). New York, NY: Routledge.
- Kangaspunta, K. (2015, April). *The Social Etiology of Human Trafficking, Their Global Distribution and Differences: Setting the Scene*. Paper presented at the Plenary session on Human Trafficking: Issues Beyond Criminalization, The Pontifical Academy of Social Sciences, Vatican City.
- Kara, S. (2017). *Sex Trafficking: Inside the Business of Modern Slavery* (2017 ed.). New York: Columbia University Press.
- Kaye, J. & Winterdyk, J. (2012). Explaining Human Trafficking. In J. Winterdyk, B. Perrin, & P. Reichel (Eds.), *Human Trafficking: Exploring the International Nature, Concerns, and Complexities* (pp. 57-78). Boca Raton, FL: CRC Press.

- Kempadoo, K. (1998). Introduction: Globalizing Sex Workers's Rights. In K. Kempadoo & J. Doezema (Eds.), *Global Sex Workers: Rights, Resistance, and Redefinition* (pp. 1-28). New York, NY: Routledge.
- Keo, C. (2014). *Human Trafficking in Cambodia*. London, UK: Routledge.
- Le, V. (2012). Organized Crime Typologies: Structure, Activities and Conditions. *International Journal of Criminology and Sociology*, 1, 121-131.
- Lee, M. (2011). *Trafficking and Global Crime Control*. London: SAGE Publications Ltd.
- Lutya, T. M. (2010). Lifestyles and Routine Activities of South African Teenagers At Risk of Being Trafficked for Involuntary Prostitution. *Journal of Child and Adolescent Mental Health*, 22(2), 91-110.
- MacKinnon, C. A. (2011). Trafficking, Prostitution, and Inequality. *Harvard Civil Rights-Civil Liberties Law Review*, 46(2), 271-309.
- Martin, S. F. (2001). Forced Migration and Professionalism. *The International Migration Review*, 35(1), 226-243.
- Masika, R. (Ed.). (2002). *Gender, Trafficking, and Slavery*. Oxford: Oxfam GB.
- Mathias, W. J. & McCabe, K. A. (2010). Sex Trafficking in the Countries of South Africa, Mozambique, and Zimbabwe. In K. A. McCabe & S. Manian (Eds.), *Sex Trafficking: A Global Perspective* (pp. 25-32). Plymouth, UK: Rowman and Littlefield Publishers.
- Mattar, M. Y. (2006). Human Security or State Security? The Overriding Threat in Trafficking in Persons. *Intercultural Human Rights Law Review*, 1, 249-279.
- McCabe, K. A. (2013). Common Forms of Sex Trafficking. In M. C. Burke (Ed.), *Human Trafficking: Interdisciplinary Perspectives* (pp. 133-148). New York, NY: Routledge.
- Merriam, K. (2005). Stopping the Traffic in Women: Power, Agency and Abolition in Feminist Debates over Sex-Trafficking. *Journal of Social Philosophy*, 36(1), 1-17.
- Michael, S. D. (2014). Human Trafficking in Malaysia: The Response of the Malaysian Government. *Malaysian Journal of International Relations*, 2, 106-192.
- Monzini, P. (2004). Trafficking in Women and Girls and the Involvement of Organised Crime in Western and Central Europe. *International Review of Victimology*, 2, 73-88.
- Newman, B. N. (2013). Historical Perspective: Slavery over the Centuries. In M. C. Burke (ed.), *Human Trafficking: Interdisciplinary Perspectives* (pp. 24-47). New York, NY: Routledge.
- Nichols, A. J. (2013). Meaning-Making and Domestic Violence Victim Advocacy: An Examination of Feminist Identities, Ideologies, and Practices. *Feminist Criminology*, 8(3), 177-201.

- O'Brien, E., Hayes, S., & Carpenter, B. (2013). Causes of Trafficking. In E. O'Brien, S. Hayes, & B. Carpenter (Eds.), *Politics of Sex Trafficking* (pp. 132-165). London: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Oblinger, D. G. (2015). Sex Trafficking in a Sexually Oriented Business. In M. J. Palmiotto (Ed.), *Combating Human Trafficking: A Multidisciplinary Approach* (pp. 129-148). Boca Raton, FL: CRC Press.
- Obokata, T. (2006). *Trafficking of Human Beings from A Human Rights Perspective: Towards A Holistic Approach*. Leiden: Martinus Nijhoff Publishers.
- Pandya, H. & Pandya, H. (2011). Racial Discrimination and Human Trafficking in India: Challenges Ahead. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science*, 1(6), 97-121.
- Poude, M. & Smyth, I. (2002). Reducing Poverty and Upholding Human Rights: A Pragmatic Approach. *Gender and Development*, 10(1), 80-86.
- Radeva, M., Trossero, E., & Pluim, M. (2009). Improving International Counter-Trafficking Cooperation: Transnational Referral Mechanisms. In C. Friesendorf (Ed.), *Strategies Against Human Trafficking: The Role of the Security Sector* (pp. 459-476). Vienna: National Defence Academy.
- Rahman, M. A. (2011). Human Trafficking in the Era of Globalization: The case of Trafficking in the Global Market Economy. *Transcience Journal*, 2(1), 54-71.
- Rijken, C. (2009). A Human Rights Based Approach To Trafficking In Human Beings. *Security and Human Rights*, 20(3), 212-222.
- Rijken, C. & Volder, E. D. (2009). The European Union's Struggle to Realize a Human Rights-Based Approach to Trafficking in Human Beings. *Connecticut Journal Of International Law*, 25(49), 49-79.
- Ryf, K. C. (2002). The First Modern Anti-Slavery Law: The Trafficking Victims Protection Act of 2000. *Case Western Reserve Journal of International Law*, 34(1), 45-71.
- Saat, G. (2009). Human Trafficking from the Philippines to Malaysia: The Impact of Urbanism. *South Asian Survey*, 16(1), 137-148.
- Salt, J. (2000). Trafficking and human smuggling: A European perspective. *International Migration*, 38(3), 31-56.
- Salt, J. & Stein, J. (1997). Migration as a Business: The Case of Trafficking. *International Migration*, 35(4), 467-494.
- Sanghera, J. (2012). Unpacking Trafficking Discourse. In K. Kempadoo, J. Sanghera, & B. Pattanaik (Eds.), *Trafficking and Prostitution Reconsidered: New Perspective on Migration, Sex Work, and Human Rights* (pp. 3-24). Boulder, CO: Paradigm Publishers.
- Santos, B. D. S., Gomes, C., & Duarte, M. (2010). The Sexual Trafficking of Women: Representations of Illegality and Victimisation. *RCCS Annual Review*, 2(2), 167-191.

- Sarkar, S. (2015). Trade in Human Beings: Evidence of Money Laundering from Sex Trafficking in India and the UK. *Journal of Transnational Management*, 20(2), 107-125.
- Shah, S. M. A. (2007). Women and Globalization. *Pakistan Horizon*, 60(4), 47-67.
- Sheinis, D. (2012). The Links Between Human Trafficking, Organized Crime, and Terrorism. *American Intelligence Journal*, 30(1), 68-77.
- Shelley, L. (2010). *Human Trafficking: A global Perspective*. New York, NY: Cambridge University Press.
- Skeldon, R. (2017, September). *International Migration, Internal Migration, Mobility and Urbanization: Towards More Integrated Approaches*. Paper presented in the United Nations Expert Group Meeting on Sustainable Cities, Human Mobility and International Migration, United Nations Secretariat, New York.
- Skrobanek, S., Boonpakdi, N., & Janthakeero, C. (1997). *The Traffic in Women: Human Realities of the International Sex Trade*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Smith, C. J. & Kangaspunta, K. (2012). Defining Human Trafficking and Its Nuances in a Cultural Context. In J. Winterdyk, B. Perrin, & P. Reichel (Eds.), *Human Trafficking: Exploring the International Nature, Concerns, and Complexities* (pp. 19-37). Boca Raton, FL: CRC Press.
- Sokoloff, N. J. & Dupont, I. (2005). Domestic Violence at the Intersections of Race, Class, and Gender: Challenges and Contributions to Understanding Violence Against Marginalized Women in Diverse Communities. *Violence Against Women*, 11(1), 38-64.
- Steinl, L. (2017). *Child Soldiers as Agents of War and Peace: A Restorative Transitional Justice Approach to Accountability for Crimes Under International Law*. The Hague: T.M.C Asser Press.
- Stoecker, S. (2000). The Rise in Human Trafficking and The Role of Organized Crime. *Demokratizatsiya*, 8(1), 129-144.
- Tiefenbrun, S. (2007). Child Soldiers, Slavery and the Trafficking of Children. *Fordham International Law Journal*, 31(2), 415-486.
- Tsai, P. L. & Tsay, C. L. (2004). Foreign Direct Investment and International Labour Migration in Economic Development: Indonesia, Malaysia, Philippines and Thailand. In A. Ananta & E. V Arifin (Eds.), *International Migration in Southeast Asia* (pp. 94-136). Singapore: Institute of Southeast Asian Studies.
- Turek, J. M. (2013). Human Security and Development Issues in Human Trafficking. In M. C. Burke (Ed.), *Human Trafficking: Interdisciplinary Perspectives* (pp. 73-87). New York, NY: Routledge.
- Tyagi, M. (2017). *Theory of Indian Diaspora: Dynamics of Global Migration*. New Delhi: Horizon Books.

- Uddin, M. B. (2014). Human Trafficking in South Asia: Issues of Corruption and Human Security. *International Journal of Social Work and Human Services Practice*, 2(1), 18-27.
- UNODC. (2006). *Trafficking in Persons: Global Patterns*. Vienna: author.
- UNODC. (2004). *United Nations Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime And The Protocols Thereto*. Vienna: author.
- Vayrynen, R. (2003, September). *Illegal Immigration, Human Trafficking, and Organized Crime*. Discussion Paper 2003/072, United Nations University (UNU)- World Institute for Development Economics Research (WIDER), Finland.
- Verkuyten, M., Mepham, K., & Kros, M. (2018). Public Attitudes Towards Support for Migrants: The Importance of Perceived Voluntary and Involuntary Migration. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 41(5), 901-918.
- Vermeulen, G. (2001). International Trafficking in Women and Children. *International Review of Penal Law*, 72(3-4), 840-841.
- Vlachová, M. (2005). Trafficking in Humans: The Slavery of Our Age. *Connections*, 4(4), 1-16.
- Vogel, D. (2017). The Concept of Demand in the Context of Trafficking in Human Beings. *Psychosociological Issues in Human Resource Management*, 5(1), 193-234.
- Watson, J. & Silkston, C. (2006). Human Trafficking as a Form of Gender-Based Violence: Protecting the Victim. *Agenda*, 20(70), 110-118.
- Wheaton, E. M., Schauer, E. J., & Galli, T. V. (2010). Economics of Human Trafficking. *International Migration*, 48(4), 114-141.
- Wijers, M. (2004). An Exploration of the Meaning of a Human Rights Based Approach to Trafficking. In H. Dobby, A. Penfold, & B. Pattanaik (Eds.), *Alliance News: A Rights Based Approach to Trafficking* (pp. 74-80). Bangkok: Global Alliance Against Traffic in Women.
- Williams, P. (2009). Combating Human Trafficking: Improving Governance Institutions, Mechanisms & Strategies. In C. Friesendorf (Ed.), *Strategies Against Human Trafficking: The Role of the Security Sector* (pp. 381-426). Vienna: National Defence Academy.
- Williams, P. (2001). Transnational Criminal Networks. In J. Arquilla & D. Ronfeldt (Eds.), *Networks and Netwars: The Future of Terror, Crime, and Militancy* (pp. 61-97). Santa Monica, CA: RAND Corporation.
- Wohlfeld, M. (2014). Is Migration a Security Issue? In O. Grech & M. Wohlfeld (Eds.), *Migration in the Mediterranean: Human Rights, Security and Development Perspectives* (pp. 61-77). Malta: Gutenberg Press.
- Xia, M. (2008). Organizational Formations of Organized Crime in China: Perspectives from the State, Markets, and Networks. *Journal of Contemporary China*, 17(54), 1-23.

- Zhang, S. X. (2009). Beyond the 'Natasha' Story: A Review and Critique of Current Research on Sex Trafficking. *Global Crime*, 10(3), 178-195.
- Zimmerman, C. & Kiss, L. (2017). Human Trafficking and Exploitation: A Global Health Concern. *PLoS Medicine*, 14(11), 1-11.